Quality and Efficiency in Vocational Education through Sino-German Cooperation

Zhao Zhiqun  Doctor , Professor
Beijing Normal University
Head of the Institute of Vocational and Adult Education, Faculty of Education
phone : 010-58800703
e-mail : zhiqunzhao@263.net
Statement

➢ The concept – “Improving Quality and Efficiency in VET” is often present in scientific literature;

➢ VET is generally believed to have a public-interest nature such as "promoting the development of vulnerable groups", there are few researches on "effectiveness and efficiency" of VET except for a few ones studying education "investment efficiency"

➢ The important subject of current research and practice is on the establishment of quality assurance system for VET.

➢ The importance of establishing an internal quality assurance system has been recognised, yet attention is still to be paid to external quality assessment researches and practices, particularly by third-parties.
Statement

- Now, from the government's perspective there are currently extensive publicity of Sino-German cooperation projects; however, there are limited empirical studies to assess benefits of such cooperation projects;

- Understanding of “benefits” were all limited to the scope of "outputs", such as "trained teachers and the management team" and "introduced concepts of vocational education" and so on.

- A few studies analysed the characteristic and results of Sino-German cooperation programmes and found that there are disagreements over the cooperation efficiency for workers in different backgrounds.

- There has been little attention paid to the impacts of cooperation and the practical influence on China’s VE sector.
Sino-German cooperation on VET has significant implications

From Sep, 26, 2012, *Guangming Daily*

An official of Ministry of Education said, Sino-German VET cooperation involves partnerships between governments, industries, educational institutions and private sector. The cooperation has rich content and extensive participants. The achievements are shown below:

- more than 100,000 people of both sides involved in communication and exchange;
- established around 100 programmes, studied and developed several hundred kinds of majors, courses and textbooks;
- trained over 700 headmasters and 2000 teachers for China’s middle and higher vocational college.
Jiang Dayuan: VE of Sino-German cooperation in the field of higher vocational education
From *Chinese Vocational and Technical Education* NO.32, 2009

China and German cooperate in the field of higher vocational education, including four aspects below:

- Faculty training
- Cooperative education
- Technical training
- Reform exploration
**Jiang Dayuan: Summarization of Sino-German cooperation in the field of higher vocational education**

From *Chinese Vocational and Technical Education* NO.32, 2009

**Faculty training**

- **Intergovernmental cooperation**
  1. Sino-German Faculty Training Programme (results: formed curriculum developmental model; developed some professional courses; trained some leaders of curriculum development; promoted curriculum reforms of some colleges)
  2. Sino-German VE Teaching Methodologie and Quality Management Training. (results: held two training programmes)

- **Cooperation between schools**
  1. Beijing Vocational College of Finance and Trade
  2. Suzhou Industrial Park Vocational and Technical College

*for instance*
Jiang Dayuan: Overview of Sino-German cooperation in the field of higher vocational education
From Chinese Vocational and Technical Education NO.32, 2009

Cooperative education

- Intergovernmental cooperation
  1. GTZ/GIZ programmes of Tianjin Sino-German Vocational and Technical College and Anhui press and publicity vocational and technical college;
  2. HSS programme of Shanghai electronic information vocational and technical college and Hubei light industry vocational and technical college.

- Cooperation between institutions
  Chinese vocational colleges cooperate with
  1. regular German schools
  2. (private) educational groups
  3. companies
  4. research institutes
  5. social organizations.
Zhao Zhiqun, Xu Han
Learning from Dual VET experience: Sino-German cooperation study and development programme
From 《Handbook of TVET research》, Springer, 2009

The output of Sino-German vocational education cooperation can be concluded in four aspects below:

- Established training goals based on professional competence building;
- (Partly) developed comprehensive curriculum with vocational activities as the core component;
- Reformed teaching contents based on the principles of "basic, extensive, practical and advanced";
- Explored student-oriented teaching forms and methodologies
What is the Result/Effect?

- Effect is the change of some original state (as a result of intervention);
- Effect can be planned or non-planned, expected or unexpected;
- Effect can appear at the early stage of intervention or throughout the project, even in completely different fields.
- Effect of cooperation is the result of social interaction.

*From Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ): Handreichung zur Bearbeitung von AURA-Angeboten, 2003*
Effect Chain

- **33%**
  - Improved VET quality
  - Educational institution improved teaching methods and ways
- **11%**
  - Improved VET quality
- **2,2%**
  - Long-term and sustainable development of employment
- **0,2%**
  - Contributions to the development of economy and society

**Benefits of programme**

- Project work
- Cooperation project provide help to VET staff

**Source:** (GTZ) AURA, 2003
Liu Bangxiang:
Contributions and limitations of Sino-German vocational education cooperation programme from different perspectives

Questionnaire: overall evaluation on Sino-German vocational education cooperation

*positive attitude towards contributions (√)*
*consider should be improved (×)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>professional staff</th>
<th>faculty</th>
<th>concept s of VE</th>
<th>Regulations</th>
<th>teaching material</th>
<th>best practice</th>
<th>curriculum develop</th>
<th>promotion projects</th>
<th>ability evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12√ 3×</td>
<td>12√ 2×</td>
<td>14√ 10×</td>
<td>6√ 1×</td>
<td>5√ 7× 9√ 7× 2√ 6× 2√</td>
<td>11×</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Liu Bangxiang:
Contributions and limitations of Sino-German vocational education cooperation programme from different perspectives

- the main contributions are training teachers and management team, introducing concepts and developing curriculums;
- knowledge of cooperation practice differs because of different working backgrounds;
- funds and equipment availability is no longer barriers for project implementation. Expectations of decision makers on both sides, candidate for key execution team and cross-culture competence have become decisive factors to ensure the success of cooperation.
- key point in next step: establish VE management system and regulations and professional competence evaluation system
- empirical studies are needed to explore cooperation experience and effects in depth. It is recommended to advance China’s VE with achieving particular breakthroughs.
### Comparisons of Sino-German teaching plan (mechatronics)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MOE's latest standards of VE on electromechanical application (ME equipment install and commissioning)</th>
<th>German teaching plan in form of “learning field” Mechatronics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- electrical and electronic technology and skills</td>
<td>- analyse relationship of mechatronics function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- mechanical drawing</td>
<td>- develop mechatronics subsystem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- mechanical basis</td>
<td>- instal electronic system with safety cooncerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- air motion and liquid pressure</td>
<td>- electronic parts energy and information flow analysis for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- applying sensor technology</td>
<td>air motion and liquid pressure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- electronic control and PLC</td>
<td>- communication with data process system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- installation and maintenance of circuits</td>
<td>- plan and organise working procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- fitter skills training</td>
<td>- simple mechatronics unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- electrician skills training</td>
<td>- design and assemble mechatronics system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- electronics skills training</td>
<td>- information flow analysis on complex mechatronics system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- mechanical dismantling skills training</td>
<td>- develop install and uninstall plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- special training</td>
<td>- production of come mechanical systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- commissioning, overhall and error detecting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- preventive maintenance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- deliver mechatronics system to customers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Still discipline oriented, no relationship to German curriculum model
Sino-German Cooperation Research Project: KOMET

- capacity level
  - shaping
  - procedural
  - functional

- evaluation criteria
  - environmental friendly
  - creativity
  - social responsibility
  - economy
  - user value orientated
  - working process & production (businesss) oriented
  - function
  - explanation / presentation

Sino-German Cooperation Research Project: KOMET

Kompetenzmodell

The comparison of vocational competence between China and Germany (electrical technology)

- Chinese teachers
  - 3%
  - 56%
  - 39%
  - 3%

- Students with dual VET in Hessen, Germany
  - 22%
  - 40%
  - 23%
  - 15%

- Chinese vocational college students
  - 34%
  - 59%
  - 7%

Legend:
- nominal
- functional
- procedural
- shaping

Zhao Zhigun
The results of evaluation of vocational competence of Chinese and German students (vehicle maintenance)
The results of sampling measurement on professional mechanical teachers' abilities

- School with Sino-German cooperation programme
- Control school
- School with "wissenschaftliche Begleitung" (academic monitoring)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Mean (MW)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jiangsu Province</td>
<td>n=52, MW=41.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhejiang Province</td>
<td>n=41, MW=41.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guangzhou City</td>
<td>n=33, MW=49.02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All institutions</td>
<td>n=126, MW=43.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

赵志群
Overview of Status Quo

- Sino-German VE cooperation conducted a large amount of activities, and Chinese stakeholders are very positive about the overall cooperation results.
- Most results of cooperation stays at "output " level.
- The influence of cooperation on China's VE sector are still limited at certain places. Deeper and more extensive impact are needed.
- The major reason for this phenomenon is academic ignorance (Ziefuss 1996), and the lack of influence from strategic methodological thinking, empirical researches and technological tools.
Relations among VE management, research and practice

Sino - German
VE Cooperation
### Recommendations: introducing the concept of total quality management (TQG) and optimise current quality system

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TQG (such as ISO &amp; EFQM)</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>from companies</td>
<td>from public sector and non-profit organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>theoretical basis: economics</td>
<td>theoretical basis: sociology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clear objective, e.g. profit maximisation</td>
<td>comprehensive objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>participation: bottom-up</td>
<td>participation: bottom-up and top-down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public competition</td>
<td>limited or no competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>evaluation criteria set in advance</td>
<td>changing evaluation criteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>responsible for values for shareholders</td>
<td>responsible for stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>all staff involved</td>
<td>some staff not involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>continuous activity</td>
<td>periodical activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>internal activity (self assessment)</td>
<td>internal and (or) external activity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Reinhard Stockmann. 非营利性机构的评估与质量改进（中文版）. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2008
感谢大家

Thank you for your attention!

Prof. Dr. phil. Zhiqun Zhao
Head of the Institute of Vocational and Adult Education,
Faculty of Education
Beijing Normal University
19 Xinjiekouwai Street, 100875 Beijing, PR China
Phone number: +86 (0)10- 58800703
Email: zhiqunzhao@263.net

赵志群
北京师范大学
职业与成人教育研究所(所长/教授)
地址：北京新街口外大街19号，邮政编码：100875
电话/传真：010- 58800703
E-mail: zhiqunzhao@263.net